Freedom of speech and expression in Pakistan

Muhammad Muzammil

Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan muzzamil.arain@gmail.com

Tansif Ur Rehman

Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan tansif@live.com

Abdul Rafiu

Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan abdul.rafaybmw@gmail.com

Jibran Ali

Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Pakistan jibranreki22@gmail.com

DOI: 10.23917/laj.v9i1.5202

Submission Track:

Received: 26 May 2024

Final Revision: 30 August 2024

Available Online: 13 November 2024

Corresponding Author: Muhammad Muzammil muzzamil.arain@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

A robust democracy requires freedom of speech and expression, fundamental rights protected by Pakistan's Constitution. However, these are not true and are limited to social and national interests. This article examines Pakistan's delicate balance between democracy and the rule of law to identify trends and issues. It highlights their significance for societal advancement, democratic government, and individual empowerment. Through due process, research data, and social impact, it examines current situations and suggests ways to improve while promoting responsible teaching. Research shows that healthy speech freedoms and relationships require balancing freedom and responsibility. Research is recommended on public awareness, access to justice, protection of minority rights, media ethics, and reduction of restrictions. Implications and future directions illustrate the changing nature of free disclosure, especially in the digital age. It requires policymakers, activists, and experts to examine new technologies, legal systems, leadership, media literacy, and emergencies.

Keywords: freedom of expression, religious beliefs, fundamental rights, reasonable restrictions, criticism

INTRODUCTION

The concept of rights and responsibility is as old as humanity. Some rights have been declared essential rights. In the early phases of human evolution, no one was willing to acknowledge the right to freedom of expression. A ruler was paramount, and those who were enslaved had no right to inquire or express what they saw. If anyone thought and said anything about what he thought, he would suffer the worst.

Freedom of speech, while in a case law study, provides us an opportunity to come to statistics regarding the ups and downs of this fundamental right and to give suggestions for its improvement; the same has been put forth here. One of the essential rights recognized in human rights charters is freedom of speech. Freedom of speech is acknowledged worldwide and even envisioned in several charters. Gender discrimination does not exist in Pakistan; every individual is guaranteed equal rights under the Pakistani Constitution (Ramzan et al., 2019).

In many dictionaries, freedom is defined as the right to express one's will, express, or think; speech, on the other hand, refers to the capacity for clear vocal expression of ideas and emotions. Freedom also refers to restraint or self-control. It is analogous to the political or legal support of the body and mind in a free society. (Union of India v. Maneka Gandhi, A.I.R. 1978)

Freedom of speech is the way to communicate freely. Similarly, freedom of expression is how to demonstrate thoughts through various means, including the press and entertainment media. Both rights are guaranteed in the Constitution of Pakistan, 1973, and are globally conceded as the foundation of human rights protected by numerous national and international legal frameworks. However, these rights are not absolute and have certain limitations for various reasons. One of the central tenets of human rights is freedom of speech, which is protected by several regional and international agreements, charters, and frameworks (De Varennes, 2021).

Speech and expression freedom generally ensures a person's participation in democratic work. In democratic societies, freedom of expression promotes acceptance of many points of view and aids legislators in appreciating their merits (Lakier, 2020).

In the contemporary era, democratic governments encounter minimal impediments with regard to the protection of speech rights. The challenge is to achieve a balance between the protection of freedom of expression in a peaceful environment and the maintenance of security, the upholding of law and order in a state that values diversity in terms of religion, philosophy, and worldview. It is interesting to note that restrictions on freedom of expression exist even in

the most liberal nation in the world, the United States (Chaudary, 2014).

The Encyclopedia of Philosophy states that speech is restricted when it conflicts with other rights or principles and could have adverse social, legal, or other effects (Knox, 2020). Pakistan's constitution, like other democracies, protects the right to free speech, subject to limitations based on national security and religion. This study examines Pakistan's current status and the development of freedom of expression. (Ishfaq & Uddin, 2021).

RESEARCH JUSTIFICATION

In accordance with the tenets of democracy, the Constitution of Pakistan, along with the fundamental human rights and democratic ideals espoused by the nation, uphold the right to freedom of speech and expression. The protection of the constitution, democratic principles, international obligations, diversity and plurality, accountability and transparency, social growth and innovation, peaceful conflict resolution, and intellectual and creative freedom represent essential arguments in favor of this defense. The following elements illustrate the vital importance of safeguarding Pakistan's freedom of speech and expression in order to sustain the country's dynamic democratic culture and the well-being of its citizens.

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

Research objectives about Pakistani freedom of speech and expression usually seek to look at and understand various aspects of this fundamental right within the specific socio-political context of the country. Here are some potential research objectives:

- Legal Framework Analysis: Examine the existing legal framework governing Pakistan's freedom of speech and expression and evaluate whether these laws align with international standards and human rights conventions.
- Case Studies and Jurisprudence: Analyze landmark legal cases about the right to free speech and expression. Identify trends in judicial decisions and their impact on protecting this right.
- 3. **Media Landscape:** Examine Pakistan's level of media freedom. The degree of media outlets' autonomy and independence is necessary. Examine any obstacles or limitations that media outlets and journalists may be facing.
- 4. **Social and Cultural Influences:** Examine the influence of societal and cultural factors on

- freedom of speech and expression. Navigate how cultural norms and values may impact the exercise of this right.
- 5. **Digital Rights and Online Expression:** Explore the implications of freedom of speech in the digital age, using issues related to online censorship, surveillance, and their impact on digital freedom as an example.
- 6. **Government Policies and Practices:** Examine the laws and procedures that assist or obstruct the right to free speech and expression. What matters is how well these policies are implemented and how well they protect this right.
- Civil Society and Advocacy: Examine the role of civil society organizations and advocacy
 groups in promoting freedom. Evaluate the effectiveness of their efforts and identify areas for
 improvement.
- 8. **International Comparisons:** Compare Pakistan's freedom of speech with that of other countries in the region or Imagine best practices and lessons from other jurisdictions.
- 9. **Education and Awareness:** Evaluate the general public's knowledge and comprehension of the right to free speech and expression. Increase education's role in fostering a society that respects and defends this freedom.
- 10. **Challenges and Solutions:** Identify the main challenges and threats to freedom of speech in Pakistan. Provide recommendations and solutions to address these challenges and enhance the protection of this fundamental right. Research addressing these objectives can contribute to a comprehensive understanding of the state of free speech and expression in Pakistan and provide insight for future advocacy or policy changes.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employed a systematic review methodology, with research objectives established accordingly. A comprehensive literature review was conducted (Komba & Lwoga, 2020). Research findings were categorized based on their content (Hiver et al., 2021; Petticrew & Roberts, 2006), and classified information was incorporated into the study by organizing it into headings (Gan et al., 2021; Pawson et al., 2005). The evaluation of classified information and titles formed the basis of the study (Page, 2021; Rahi, 2017), ensuring the integrity of the research subject and its contents (Egger et al., 2022; Victor, 2008).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Article 19 of the 1973 Constitution guarantees freedom of expression to all citizens of Pakistan, subject to predetermined limitations such as the "glory of Islam," "law and order," and "national security" (Ahmad & Malik, 2020).

Extremist beliefs were fostered by the state-sponsored religion that General Zia's dictatorship promoted (Kalin & Siddiqui, 2014). Freedom of expression includes the freedom to speak, choose, and acknowledge one's faith, engage in free political speech, obtain information, and be free from hate speech (Mondal, 2016). However, these rights are hardly secured in the current theocratic-political legislative climate. The immunity granted by free speech rights is routinely abused by clergy and other authorities, who exploit it to promote hate speech, accuse Muslims and other minorities of blasphemy, and censor material on the grounds of "national security" (Mondal, 2016).

Freedom of speech is restricted in a nation. In a nation like Pakistan, where there is little time set aside for expressing one's personal opinions and little freedom of expression (Melissen, 2005), Laws are essential for protecting the individual's freedom of expression because they punish violent criminals while also allowing non-violent expressions to be punished. Ultimately, infidelity is ineffective and can lead to more conflict and instability (Udin, 2011).

Laws protect the individual's freedom of expression by allowing violent criminals to be punished while ensuring that non-violent expressions are punished. Ultimately, infidelity is ineffective and can lead to more conflict and instability (Udin, 2011). Jamil (2019) contends that there is no explicit legislation governing freedom of expression online, which also affects Pakistan, even though Pakistan's Constitution's Articles 19 and 19a guarantee freedom of expression and access to information. The Pakistan Telecommunication Authority's (P.T.A.) rules and regulations apply to online material. The topic of blasphemy from outside sources is also examined in Jamil (2019), along with the Pakistani government's response, which includes the *YouTube* ban (2019, Jamil).

According to the writers, harmful or offensive information will be taken down from the website. If not, the entire site would become inappropriate. Authors, ignoring online comments and information, and creating filters are all ways to solve these problems. (Jamil, 2019). "A set of codes of conduct has been established to prevent journalists from discussing specific issues while reporting in the media" (Ashraf and Shabir, 2015).

Constitution of Pakistan

Pakistan is just like the rest of the globe. One of Pakistan's essential rights, guaranteed by the constitution, is freedom of expression. Article 19 of the Constitution of Pakistan states: "19. Freedom of speech: Every citizen shall have the right to freedom of speech and expression, and there shall be freedom of the press, subject to any reasonable restrictions imposed by law in the interest of the integrity, security, or defense of Pakistan or any part thereof, friendly relations with foreign states, public order, decency, or morality, or about contempt of court, the commission of or incitement to an offense."

In a recent ruling, the Supreme Court of Pakistan reaffirmed the principle that the fundamental right to freedom of expression, press, and media cannot be restricted beyond the limits set forth in Article 19 of the Constitution. This encompasses the government, its institutions, and intelligence services. Those who employ these strategies are deluded into believing that they are achieving a higher purpose. The constitution governs Pakistan, and obedience to the constitution and the laws is the inalienable duty of every citizen, wherever he may be, and of all jurisdictions in Pakistan (PLD 2019 SC 318).

It also happens in practice. Pakistanis know that they must be cautious when talking about religion or any state. Restrictions on freedom of expression often include restrictions on publication, fines for publication, the obligation for journalists to disclose sources, disciplinary penalties, or confiscation of information. (Ayesha, 2022)

Last but not least, we need to redefine the concept of freedom of expression. If freedom of expression violates the rights of others or causes violence, hatred, and discrimination, it is hate speech. Haters should have no place in people's lives. Therefore, the limitations contained in Article 19 are not primary but consequential. (Khadim, 2023)

Practice in Pakistan

The Pakistani Constitution's Article 19 guarantees freedom of speech, irrespective of gender. In Pakistan, it is customary to restrict women's freedom of speech in all spheres of life. They are not concerned about their freedom to express their opinions or their feelings; instead, they are viewed as idols or as persons in slavery (Ramzan et al., 2019).

These are not tolerated, and it is considered that society has decided to call them out. It is a common practice, and people will misuse it when given power. The right to free speech safeguards

https://journals2.ums.ac.id/index.php/laj/article/view/5202

against the misuse of power, particularly state power. People can now exercise self-control thanks to it. As long as it does not infringe upon the rights of others, it refers to freedom of expression and promotion. Women's right to free speech is occasionally granted to their mother, father, brother, and uncle. (Ramzan et al., 2019)

Remedy on the Violation of Human Rights

The first chapter of the constitution guarantees several fundamental rights to the Pakistani people. However, Pakistan lacks a specific constitutional court for constitutional violations. People can only approach the High Court or Supreme Court through constitutional petitions whenever an alternative remedy is available. The government has provided this remedy at the doorstep of the Court of Session on a local basis under provision 111 of Section 22A-22B of the Pakistan Code of Criminal Procedure.

Significance of Freedom of Speech and Expression

The most important lesson is that a country cannot attain democracy until its people can express their opinions and connect without hindrance. Without this right, the government might stop taking responsibility for its actions and policies and start prioritizing its interests over those of the country and its citizens. It is also important to note that this freedom benefits the nation's impoverished and vulnerable citizens, who often face greater challenges than wealthy segments of society in speaking up against injustice. Since the press is free to report crimes, corruption, and other forms of violence, it is essential to upkeep checks and balances in both society and government.

This kind of right helps a nation's residents investigate, innovate, and progress in various economic sectors since it grants them freedom of speech, thought, religion, and worship. (Manikuze, Jean-Paul, 2023). All democratic organizations are built on the principles of freedom of speech and the press because, without open political discourse, public education, which is crucial to the smooth operation of the political system, cannot occur (Ayesha Aijaz, 2022).

Violation of Freedom of Speech Based on Sex in Pakistan

Right of Marriage: Women in Pakistan may face restrictions on their freedom of speech
concerning marriage, particularly in cases of forced or child marriages. Cultural and societal
norms sometimes suppress women's voices regarding their marital choices, and those who
speak out against such practices may face backlash or even violence.

- 2. **Right of Property:** Women in Pakistan often encounter limited freedom of speech regarding property rights. Decreased legal protections, customary practices, and societal attitudes may inhibit women from asserting their inheritance or property ownership rights. Speaking out against such discrimination may lead to social ostracism or familial conflict.
- 3. **Right to Job:** Women in Pakistan face significant barriers to their freedom of speech in the workplace. Gender discrimination, harassment, and unequal opportunities limit women's ability to voice concerns about workplace conditions or advocate for their rights. Fear of reprisal or stigma may discourage women from speaking out against workplace injustices.
- 4. **Right to Vote:** While legally guaranteed, women in Pakistan may encounter challenges exercising their freedom of speech through the right to vote. Cultural norms, intimidation tactics, and limited access to polling stations may hinder women's participation in the electoral process. Speaking out against such obstacles may be met with resistance or violence from conservative elements. (Nia Kirmani,2000)

Democratic Foundation of Right to Free Speech and Expression

Franklin S. Haiman states that "the freedom of speech and expression is more advantageous to listeners than to speakers; consequently, it is a violation of the right to freedom of speech and expression if listeners and speakers are unable to hear each other's ideas and thoughts" (R. Aqa, 2016).

For the following reasons, having the right to free speech is essential to having freedom:

- 1. Freedom of speech is crucial for democracy to sustain plurality and diversity in society regarding religion, lifestyle, philosophy, nationality, and ethnicity. However, to be pluralist, society must coexist with a variety of opposing beliefs and ideologies.
- 2. The political value of freedom of expression is essential to democratic government because it enables participation in decision-making and the enactment of laws.
- 3. Since everyone in a democratic society can voice their opinions, freedom of expression is also crucial to society morally. Any limitation, though, risks violating someone's moral autonomy (A. Zuhtu, 2015).

Why does freedom of speech and expression matter?

In democracies, the right to free expression is paramount. Opinions and documents emphasize public accountability and openness in governance while also assisting in educating

political discourse. It involves the freedom to express oneself verbally, visually, and physically through actions like open demonstrations and protests, for example. Pakistan's 1973 Constitution safeguards all of these rights.

A society's ability to evolve healthily depends on its citizens' ability to obtain information, hold the government responsible, and talk freely about critical social concerns. International, regional, and national norms also acknowledge that freedom of expression extends to all media, including spoken, written, printed, online, and artistic expression (Maikuze, 23).

Innovation

Freedom of expression ensures the encouragement of the innovative spirit. Nations such as the United States and the United Kingdom offer hospitable environments for people to think freely and create new products, ideas, and services. It also plays a vital role in developing a nation, as freedom of expression facilitates the conduit of contact between the public and the government. An autocratic ruler could never comprehend the issues that everyday people face, as we experienced in the early ages of Pakistan. The political leadership might gather input from the public before enacting a social program or plan to improve the social and economic circumstances of the people (Maikuze, 2023).

Case Laws

There are indeed legal restrictions on the freedom of speech and expression provided by Article 19 of the Constitution; these restrictions are equivalent to contempt of court. However, the right is not absolute, limitless, or unconstrained. The defense of the right to free speech and expression cannot be extended to speech, language, or advertising that may annoy, disrupt, embarrass, or honestly interfere with the administration, alarm the Court and Lordships, or cause hatred, insult, or slander. (20 9 SCMR 542). The most questionable rights are those related to peaceful protest and freedom of speech. However, these rights must be exercised by the law, and there is no right to compromise the public's first and foremost duty of justice for the country. No one, old or innocent, can influence the lives of citizens or question or challenge the state. (20 9 MLD 790)

Islamabad High Court Decision on Freedom of Speech and Expression

The Federal Investigating Agency (F.I.A.) began an investigation against journalist Rana Muhammed Arshad using an undated notice. The Islamabad High Court, a constitutional court in Pakistan, ruled that this was an abuse of the legal process and that the journalist was being "targeted as retaliation for his work." According to the court, such an action went against Articles 19 and 19A of the 1973 Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, which guarantees citizens' fundamental rights to freedom of speech and expression, the free press, and access to information of public interest. The court additionally stated that when an investigative agency abuses its coercive powers, it fundamentally undermines the freedom of the press and independence of a journalist and gives rise to retribution against professional functions. In light of these findings, the court ordered the Federal Investigating Agency to develop specific rules for actions taken against journalists. (Chief Justice Minallah, 2023)

Exploitation of Minority Groups

Under Article 19 of the Pakistani Constitution of 1973, every citizen is guaranteed the right to free speech, albeit with restrictions based on "law and order," "national security," and the "glory of Islam." Nevertheless, in some cases, these limitations have been used to target different minority groups (L. Sadaf & N. Elishma 2016).

Despite the constitutional guarantee, Pakistan has specific restrictions on the right to free speech. Several causes have contributed to this unfortunate situation. The primary causes, however, are legislation that is too restrictive, harassment, censorship, the suppression of human rights initiatives, and the persecution of religious minorities. Though religious intolerance has counterproductive effects in the form of chaos and disorder in society, Pakistani society has grown increasingly intolerant throughout time, partly due to the curriculum and education system's contribution to violence and intolerance. Thus, the media, civil society, academia, and religious groups must exercise their watchdog function to prevent hate speech and materials that incite discrimination based on race, religion, or ethnicity (L. Sadaf & N. Elishma 2016).

DISCUSSION

The fundamental right to freedom of speech and expression promotes democratic ideals and the advancement of society. The debate over freedom of speech and expression in Pakistan is complex, reflecting the variety of viewpoints present in the nation. Article 19 of the Pakistani Constitution ensures freedom of speech and expression. Nevertheless, several limitations may apply to this privilege, including those concerning "public order" and "security of the state." There have been cases in the nation when these limitations have been used to restrict free speech, raising questions about the actual scope of this fundamental right.

Pakistan has faced challenges in upholding freedom of speech and expression due to various factors. One significant issue is the existence of laws that can be perceived as restrictive, such as the blasphemy laws. The e-laws, which were designed to safeguard religious beliefs, have been the subject of criticism for their potential to be exploited in a manner that stifles dissent and targets religious minorities. The advent of the digital age has introduced novel considerations to the discourse on freedom of speech in Pakistan. The government has, on occasion, implemented measures to regulate online content, citing concerns related to national security and societal harmony. Social media platforms and online spaces have become arenas for the contestation of free expression, with debates on matters pertaining to politics and social justice.

While acknowledging the importance of protecting national security and public order, there is an ongoing debate about striking a balance between these concerns and ensuring robust freedom of speech. Critics argue that the current legal framework and its implementation can be used to suppress dissent and limit critical voices. Pakistan's civil society and human rights activists have played a crucial role in advocating for greater freedom of speech. They have worked to raise awareness about censorship, press freedom, and the impact of restrictive laws on individual liberties.

CONCLUSION

The main idea was that, except for God, everything has some defined limit. Be it this world or the universe, nothing is without limits. Concerning the above discussion, we can conclude that Pakistan is a democratic nation where every citizen is guaranteed the freedom of speech and expression under the country's constitution, which they can uphold through an independent legal system. Thus, balancing these fundamental rights and the nation's or state's common security was essential.

The state is unable to execute this work alone, but exercising these rights also requires some work on the part of the person. Article 19 of the Constitution gives a legal bulwark to its beneficiaries, empowering them to communicate their feelings with others without consternation and discomposure. Fundamental rights are incorporated to safeguard one's dignity, prestige, and privacy. Avoid statements and feelings that convey intense hatred, extremism, denominationalism, or contempt.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- There is a need for a clear and comprehensive understanding of the reasonable restrictions
 outlined in the Articles. Campaigns for public awareness and educational programs can be
 significant for spreading information about these restrictions and ensuring citizens
 understand the limits of their freedom of expression.
- 2. As the ultimate guardian of fundamental rights, the judiciary should consistently uphold the principles of reasonableness when adjudicating cases related to freedom of speech. Transparent and just decisions will help people better understand legal boundaries and foster public trust in the legal system.
- 3. Particular attention should be given to protecting the freedom of expression for minority groups, ensuring that they are not disproportionately restricted, which is an unfortunate practice in many remote areas of the country. Minority voices can contribute to a diverse and pluralistic society, so their rights should be safeguarded, as the constitution guarantees.
- 4. Media outlets significantly shape public opinion. Promoting moral journalism and accountable reporting will contribute to a healthy media environment that respects the boundaries set by reasonable restrictions.
- 5. Research on restrictions on the right to free speech and expression in Pakistan faces several challenges and limitations, reflecting the country's complex sociopolitical landscape. Some fundamental research limitations include:
- 6. The legal framework regarding freedom of speech in Pakistan can sometimes be clarified. The constitution guarantees this right but allows for restrictions in the state's interest, public order, and other considerations. Research may face challenges in interpreting and navigating these legal ambiguities.
- 7. Due to concerns about potential repercussions, individuals may hesitate to speak openly about the limitations on freedom of speech. Journalists, activists, and citizens might practice self-censorship, making obtaining accurate and comprehensive information difficult.
- 8. Some restrictions on freedom of speech need to be more transparent, making it challenging to access accurate information on specific cases or incidents. Lack of transparency and restricted access to information can hinder researchers' efforts to understand the extent and nature of these limitations.
- 9. Researching freedom of speech issues, as well as susceptible topics such as national

security, terrorism, or religious issues, can pose security risks for researchers. It may limit the scope and depth of investigations into certain topical aspects.

- 10. Pakistan's political landscape is dynamic and often polarized. Research on freedom of speech may encounter challenges related to political sensitivities, where findings could be interpreted or used to advance particular political agendas.
- 11. With the growth of digital platforms and social media, assessing limitations on online expression has become more complex. Regulatory measures and restrictions on digital content can be subject to rapid changes, making it challenging to capture the evolving nature of online free speech issues.
- 12. The lack of robust protection for whistleblowers might hinder research into government practices or abuses of freedom. Individuals who expose misconduct may fear reprisals, which can affect the willingness of potential sources to come forward.
- 13. Blasphemy laws and societal attitudes towards religious and cultural issues create a sensitive environment. Researchers might face challenges when investigating cases involving religious or cultural expressions deemed offensive or
- 14. Pakistan is a diverse and pluralistic society with varying perspectives on freedom of speech. Research should encompass the diversity of opinions, including those of marginalized groups, to provide a comprehensive understanding of the limitations different segments of society face.
- 15. Political changes and shifts in government policies can impact the research. Researchers need to account for these dynamics and their influence on implementing freedom of speech and expression.

Research Limitations

Media censorship by the government and military targets outlets critical of state policies or influential individuals, with journalists and bloggers facing threats and harassment. Cybercrime laws grant authorities broad powers to censor online content and surveil internet users, often used to target activists, journalists, and social media users critical of the government. Journalists, activists, and intellectuals face physical violence, threats, and intimidation from state and non-state actors, leading to self-censorship.

Political interference in media organizations results in biased reporting and self-censorship,

with journalists risking repercussions for challenging the status quo. The Pakistani military's influence suppresses dissent and curbs free speech to maintain its grip on power. The government imposes restrictions on public gatherings and protests, citing security concerns, and responds with excessive force to peaceful demonstrations. Pakistan's judiciary restricts free speech through judicial activism and contempt laws, stifling criticism and dissent.

Societal norms and cultural taboos restrict freedom of speech, particularly regarding religion, sexuality, and gender equality, leading to social ostracism and backlash against dissenters. The education system promotes a narrow and conservative worldview, discouraging critical thinking and dissenting opinions and perpetuating restrictions on free speech.

Research Implications

Research on freedom of speech and expression in Pakistan could yield significant societal implications. Understanding the state of freedom of speech in Pakistan can shed light on the country's democratic health, human rights situation, and socio-political dynamics. It can also inform policy-making, legal reforms, and advocacy efforts to safeguard and promote this fundamental right.

Additionally, such research can highlight challenges journalists, activists, and marginalized communities face in exercising their right to freedom of expression, including censorship, intimidation, and legal restrictions. Moreover, studying freedom of speech in Pakistan can contribute to comparative analyses with other countries, providing insights into global trends and regional dynamics in upholding this fundamental human right. Ultimately, research in this area has the potential to foster dialogue, raise awareness, and drive positive change toward a more open, inclusive, and democratic society in Pakistan.

Future Research Directions

Exploring the impact of emerging technology on Pakistan's right to free speech and expression, particularly the impact of social media, artificial intelligence, and online surveillance. Investigating the role of legislative frameworks in safeguarding freedom of speech and expression in the digital age, focusing on potential reforms and adaptations to address new challenges.

Examining the intersection of freedom of speech and cultural diversity in Pakistan, consider how diverse perspectives and voices can be accommodated and protected within the framework of free expression. Ana is analyzing the role of educational institutions in fostering a culture of free speech and expression and identifying strategies to promote critical thinking and

open dialogue among students and faculty.

Assessing the impact of geopolitical factors on freedom of speech in Pakistan, including international influences and diplomatic considerations, and exploring ways to uphold national sovereignty while respecting universal principles of free expression. Investigating the role of media literacy programs in promoting responsible and informed expression, aiming to empower individuals to navigate information sources critically and distinguish between misinformation and genuine discourse.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, N., & Malik, M. E. (2020). Freedom of Speech and Expression in The Contemporary World: A Case Study of Pakistan and Limitations of Article 19 Of The Constitution of Pakistan, 1973. Journal of the Punjab University Historical Society, 33(02).
- Aqa, R. (2016). Freedom of speech and expression is a fundamental right in India and the test of the constitution.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/306899769_'Freedom_of_Speech_and_Expression'_as_a_Fundamental_Right_in_India_and_the_Test_of_Constitutional_Regulations_The_Constitutional_Perspective

Awais, H., & Noman, M. (2021). Freedom of expression as a basic human right in Pakistan.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/362996143_FREEDOM_OF_EXPRESSION_A S_A_BASIC_HUMAN_RIGHT_IN_PAKISTAN_A_FANTASY_OR_A_REALITY

- Ayesha, A. (Aug 30, 2022) *Can speech be free? Dawn.* https://www.dawn.com/news/1707528
- Chaudary, Z.A. (2014). *Freedom of Speech and its Parameters. Daily Times*, Retrieved from http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/opinion/05-May-2014/freedom-of-speech-and-itsparametres].
- Egger, M., Higgins, J. P., & Smith, G. D. (Eds.). (2022). Systematic reviews in health research: Meta-analysis in context. John Wiley & Sons.
- Gan, J., Xie, L., Peng, G., Xie, J., Chen, Y., & Yu, Q. (2021). Systematic review on modification methods of dietary fiber. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 119, 106872. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2021.106872 10.1136/qshc.2004.012781
- Gillani, I., & Zia, U. (2021). Free speech and human rights in Pakistan.

 https://pjsr.com.pk/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/55.-Vol-3.-Issue-3.-Sept-2021-Gillani-Ishfaq-Zia-ud-Din-Free-Speech-and-Human-Rights-in-Pakistan.pdf
- Government of Pakistan. Pakistan Penal Code, 1860.

 https://www.ma-law.org.pk/pdflaw/PAKISTAN%20PENAL%20CODE.pdf

Government of Pakistan. Pakistan Telecommunication Ordinance, 1994, Regulated under

- Pakistan. Electronic Media Regulatory Authority Act of 2002.
- https://pid.gov.pk/uploads/media_laws/Ordinance_2002.pdf
- Government of Pakistan. *The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973*. http://www.parliament.am/library/parlamentarizm2019/pakistan.pdf
- Hira, M. (2022). Freedom of speech and expression in Pakistan. https://www.academia.edu/12822370/Freedom_of_speech_and_expression_in_Pakistan
- Hiver, P., Al-Hoorie, A. H., Vitta, J. P., & Wu, J. (2021). *Engagement in language learning:* A systematic review of 20 years of research methods and definitions. *Language Teaching Research*, 13621688211001289.
 - https://doi.org/10.1177/13621688211001289
- Jan, F., Ashraf, S. I., & Shah, S. F. A. (2021). Khamosh Pani: partition trauma, gender violence, and religious extremism in Pakistan. Liberal Arts and Social Sciences International Journal 5(1),16-27.
- Jamil, S. (2019). Culture of impunity and safety of journalists: Is safe journalism a distant dream in Pakistan?. World of Media. Journal of Russian Media and Journalism Studies, (1), 51-66.
- Jean, M. (2023). Freedom of speech matters.
 - https://www.eeas.europa.eu/sites/default/files/jean_paul_manikuze_1.pdf
- Kalin, M., & Siddiqui, N. (2014). *Religious Authority and the Promotion of Sectarian Tolerance in Pakistan* (Vol. 21). US Institute of Peace.
- Khadim, (2023) Redefining free speech.
 - https://www.dawn.com/news/1780146#:~:text=Last%20but%20not%20least%2C%20we, in%20human%20societies%20any%20longer.
- Knox, E. J. (2020). Intellectual freedom and social justice: Tensions between core values in American librarianship.
 - https://experts.illinois.edu/en/publications/intellectual-freedom-and-social-justice-tensions-between-core-val
- Komba, M. M., & Lwoga, E. T. (2020). Systematic review as a research method in library and information science. 10.4018/978-1-7998-1471-9.ch005.
- Maneka, G. vs. Union of India 1978 AIR 597, 1978 SCR (2) 621. https://testbook.com/ias-preparation/maneka-gandhi-case-upsc-notes#:~:text=Maneka%20Gandhi%20vs.,upheld%20the%20illegal%20passport%20seizu
- Melissen, J. (Ed.). (2005). *The new public diplomacy (pp. 292-31). New York*: Palgrave Macmillan
- Mohit, K., & Ayush, G. (2021). *Reasonable restrictions on freedom of speech*. https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/PAK/INT_CCPRPAK_27665_E.pdf
- Mondal, A. A. (2016). Articles of faith: Freedom of expression and religious freedom in contemporary multiculture. Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations, 27(1), 3-24.
- Naveed, A., & Ejaz, M. (2020). Freedom of speech and expression in the contemporary

https://journals2.ums.ac.id/index.php/laj/article/view/5202

- world: A case study of Pakistan and limitations of article 19 of the constitution of Pakistan, 1973. https://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/HistoryPStudies/PDF_Files/7_v33_2_2020.pdf
- Nia, K. (2000). *Women's rights as human rights: The case of Pakistan*. https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/268734962.pdf
- Neier, A. (2020). *The international human rights movement*. Princeton University Press. https://press.princeton.edu/books/paperback/9780691200989/the-international-human-rights-movement
- Rahi, S. (2017). *Research design and methods:* A systematic review of research paradigms, sampling issues, and instruments development. International Journal of Economics & Management Sciences, 6(2). 10.4172/2162-6359.1000403
- Ramzan, M. (2019). Freedom of speech: Infringement of women's rights in Pakistan. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/310241029_Freedom_of_Expression_in_Pakist anMyth_or_a_Reality
- Sadaf, L. (2018). *Freedom of expression in Pakistan: A myth or reality?* https://www.sdpi.org/publications/files/Freedom-of-Expression-in-Pakistan-a-myth-or-areality-W-159.pdfseen on 11.09.2018.
- The Lahore High Court, The State v. Sheikh Shaukat Ali (*Pakistan Law Digest 1976 Lah.* 355).
 - https://www.casemine.com/judgement/in/65f96b9c0b94c657a20c6c3e
- The Islamabad High Court, Rana Muhammad Arshad Vs. State, *Writ Petition No:* 2939/2020
 - https://globalfreedomofexpression.columbia.edu/cases/rana-muhammad-arshad-v-pakistan/
- The Supreme Court of Pakistan. Talal Ahmed Chaudhry Versus the State (2019 Supreme Court Monthly Review 542)
 - $https://research center.lhc.gov.pk/pdf/Publication/AhmadZia/FreedomofExpressin, Laws\&\ Limitations 2020 PLJ 140.pdf$
- The Lahore High Court. Sheikh Muhammad Nadeem Versus The (2019 Monthly Law Digest 790)
 - https://sys.lhc.gov.pk/appjudgments/2019LHC60.pdf/
- Uddin, A. T. (2015). *Free speech and public order exceptions*. https://digitalcommons.law.byu.edu/lawreview/vol2015/iss3/6/